Abstract

The tourism industry in Indonesia has been growing rapidly for a long time. Although the pandemic Covid-19 has passed now, the presence of social media influencers (SMI) in the tourism sector still exists because their existence is considered effective in promoting Indonesian tourism. They can discuss travel activities, tourist destinations or just give appreciation through emojis in the comment space. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to describe the interactions that occur between different SMI characters and their followers through posts and comments uploaded on Instagram from January to March 2023. This period was chosen because it was the momentum of the revival of Indonesian tourism after the pandemic. The research approach used is qualitative with a virtual ethnography research method, with data collection techniques in the form of observation and online data collection. The data analysis techniques used are: 1) Elicitation stage which is the collection of raw data; 2) Reduction stage which consists of 3 stages, namely: Selection-Coding-Clustering; and 3) Visualization stage. Data collection of comments was carried out using the IGCommentExporter program, meanwhile data analysis conducted by Voyant Tools program. Furthermore, the discussion themes that emerged from the findings will be discussed with the concept of Cyberculture that has been discussed previously. The unit of analysis used in this research is the text message in the comment section of the Instagram accounts of two top female travel influencers in Indonesia @medinakamil and @puanindya. By using the concept of Cyberculture, this research concludes that the interaction that occurs between travel influencers and their followers is based on the followers' interest in the influencer's figure itself and also the online friendliness that displays in the comments column.

Keywords: cyberculture, network society, tourism, travel influencer, social media
Abstrak


Kata Kunci: cyberculture, media sosial, network society, pariwisata, travel influencer

Introduction

The tourism sector is one of the pillars of the Indonesian economy and a major contributor to foreign exchange. The Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD) in the Tourism Trends and Policies 2022 report states that in 2019, the tourism sector contributed 5% of Indonesia's gross domestic income (GDP). However, the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic in 2020 resulted in a 56% drop in tourism's contribution to GDP to only 2.2% of the total economy.

To avoid a further decline in the number of tourists, the government has made 2023 the momentum for the rise of Indonesian tourism after being suspended during the pandemic. The Central Statistics Agency (BPS) noted that foreign tourist visits in the first quarter of 2023 cumulatively reached 2.5 million visits, up 508.87% compared to the same period in 2022. The Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (Kemenparekraf) also predicts that foreign tourist visits until the end of 2023 can reach approximately 9 million visits (Kemenkeu.go.id, 2023).
The results of Google Destination Insight searches in Google Trends 2022 state that foreign tourists' interest in traveling to Indonesia rose 36% in June-August 2022, compared to the same period in 2019. Global tourists who have an interest in taking a vacation trip to Indonesia, on average, choose Bali as a destination. This is reflected in Google Trends, with search results related to "Kintamani" (up 64%); "accommodation" (growing around 21%); and "air travel" (up 11%) during the same period. People are also looking for new ways to experience the best vacation spots, with Google searches for the keyword "healing travel" increasing by 40% over 2022. Meanwhile, searches on the keyword "glamping" increased by 40%; the keyword "running+biking event" increased by 42%; and searches on the keyword "festival trip" jumped by more than 90% (katadata.co.id, 2022).

Data from Google Trends 2022 also mentions that searches for travel influencers in Indonesia have increased significantly from 2021 to early 2022. This shows that more and more people are looking for information about travel influencers to get inspiration for traveling. With this phenomenon, travel influencers have also become busy carrying out tasks from their clients to promote tourist destinations for tourists to visit (Beritasatu.com, 2021). Even the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy (Menparekraf) Sandiaga Uno openly targets athletes as micro influencers to promote sports tourism in Indonesia (Kompas.com, 2022).

Travel influencers or what can be referred to as Social Media Influencers (SMI) are individuals or groups who have amassed a large following on social media, gained through creative and commercially valuable social media material, where the content focuses on their experiences and interests only (Candraningrum et al., 2022). In each post, there is an interaction between SMI and its followers, either in the form of likes, comments or sharing content. These lifestyle influencers share their personal opinions and experiences about tourist destinations so as to form expectations in their followers as consumers (Purwandari et al., 2022).

The above phenomenon creates a dilemma. On the one hand, the existence of travel influencers brings fresh air to the tourism industry. On the contrary, although many parties consider the existence of travel influencers to be able to get the specific targets and provide positive results to attract tourists, it is necessary to question the truth of the information they disseminate. Based on the results of a survey by international financial institution PricewaterhouseCoppers titled Global Consumer Insights Survey 2023, with 9,180 consumers in 25 countries, including Indonesia, 47% of respondents were very concerned with exchanging information and data on social media. As consumers, they are active in finding out about tourism activities, but are also concerned about the use of personal data and the validity of the information provided. From this phenomenon, it can be seen that global consumers are currently very concerned about the use of personal data, including being careful in conducting digital transactions and interactions such as sharing, collecting information, analyzing and disseminating information on social media (PWC, 2023).
Referring to the concept of Cyberculture, there has been a strong bond in cyberspace between social groupings in modern society between ‘society’ (Society/Gesellschaft) and ‘community’ (Community/Gemeinschaft). Society is defined as a group of individuals with strong ties, while community is temporary. In cyberspace, societies and communities come together based on common interests and visions, without any barriers. In this era of networks and information, cyberculture has been born with various forms of culture and concepts called online reality, virtual reality or cyber literature. In the end, the challenge ahead is how internet users can utilize information technology wisely. In addition, it does not make cyberspace a community place that will cause anxiety in conveying information to the wider community by utilizing the internet (Ricardo, 2008).

Starting from the explanation above, this research aims to provide an overview of the interactions that occur between virtual individuals - in this case between travel influencers and their followers on social media - in receiving information that is considered valid in postmodern era.

Cyber Culture

The term cyberculture was first used in the Oxford English Dictionary in 1963 and further developed in the 1990s. According to Bell (2001), initially the concept of cyberculture was attached to the concept of cyberspace but later, cyberspace was considered to be related to fiction, imagination and self-made stories. The concept of cyberculture became popular in academia in 1984, following the publication of the Hugo and Nebula award-winning novel Neuromancer by science fiction writer William Gibson. In this story, it tells the story of the relationships that occur in the virtual landscape.

Cyberculture is defined as a way of thinking about the interaction between digital technology and humans, that is, how they coexist, until finally forming a culture. According to Frow and Morris (2000), culture itself is defined as a network of embedded practices and representations (texts, images, conversations, codes of conduct and the narrative structures that organize them), which shape social life. Cyber culture itself is defined as a way of life in cyberspace or a way of life shaped by cyberspace, where cyberspace is a collection of embedded practices and representations (Bell, 2007).

In the concept of cyberculture, there are several moments that are considered to be part of it. Firstly, cyberspace allows individuals to connect in a virtual space where each party can convey ideas or self-existence presented as a form of legacy. However, the criticism that arises is that cyberspace can only be described and imagined, because it is intangible. The representation itself can be represented by symbols in the form of images, texts, myths and stories. Human culture requires narrative, ritual and magic. Cyberspace is considered as a stage that can create reality for the symbolic story (Ming, 2022).

Secondly, life on the screen, which is also said to be the 'nascent culture of simulation'. According to Sherry Turkle, author of book of Life on the Screen, life on the screen itself is depicted through human interaction with computers that intersect with various postmodernities such as providing several objects to think about and discuss in exploring culture.

http://dx.doi.org/10.24912/jk.v15i1.18152
This enthusiasm for exploration is largely related to a word found at the bottom right of the second page of the novel, cyberspace. This neologism was quickly defined by the authors themselves as cycling through, i.e. running several programs on the internet at once to describe different experiences in the simulated culture (multi-user domains, dimensions or dungeons). Multi-User Domains (MUDs) also represent virtual interactions that build on real-life spaces, characters and text-based interactions. Thirdly, the internet society proposed by Maria Bakardijeva, which is how offline and online life can be done together. This is done by talking to other individuals virtually, as well as making observations about their daily interactions in cyberspace, both materially and socially.

The three moments above illustrate how everyday activities can shape cyberculture and how they work in transforming the form and content of computers and cyberspace. According to Bakardijeva, referring to the explanation of sociologist Henri Lefebvre (1971, 1991), that what they do is not just utopia but to elaborate their respective visions so that they can work together in a process of routine daily activities. This is what then shapes everyday cyberculture in the cyberlife (Bell, 2007).

Cyberculture is also needed in the formation of identity and credibility in society. The exchange of messages and information between virtual communication (online) and real communication (offline), makes individual self-identity increasingly unclear, like a crisis that has no solution. The verbal and nonverbal communication that occurs to exchange the same information will remain the same until there is a change in social status and role in the media. Boundaries become unclear which results in a dilemma in the search for identity. Communication is created among followers with varied backgrounds, because the true culture in cyberspace is a culture of images and meanings that are exchanged in a symbolic interaction (Quroatun ’uyun & Hakim, 2020).

In this study, we will examine the concept of cyberculture from the three moments above, which can be seen in the comment section of an Indonesian travel influencer account with thousands of followers. From several previous studies, there are several ways to examine the interaction between influencers and their followers, which were conducted by other researchers. Research conducted by Betty Purwandari et al (2022) from the Faculty of Computer Science, University of Indonesia entitled “The Effect of Interaction between Followers and Influencers on Intention to Follow Travel Recommendations from Influencers in Indonesia Based on Follower-Influencer Experience and Emotional Dimension” to analyze the relationship between influencers and their followers on social media using the emotion dimension of commitment and willingness to recommend followers, using a quantitative approach. Data were collected from social media platforms LINE, Instagram, Twitter and Whatsapp and analyzed using Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) technique. The result of this study is that there are two things that become the main factors that trigger interactions between influencers and their followers so that individuals are willing to follow travel influencer recommendations. First, the information factor of the experience that followers have lived, which is related to the travel information recommendations received from influencers. Second, factors
related to how much the influencer who gives recommendations has in common with their followers (Purwandari et al., 2022).

Another study that examines the relationship between influencers and their networks is research conducted by Bramantyo Andrian et al. (2022) from the Faculty of Computer Science, University of Indonesia. The research was titled “Influencer detection based on sentiment analysis and social networks: a case study of Telkomsel Orbit = Influencer detection based on sentiment analysis and social networks: a case study of Telkomsel Orbit.” This study aims to assess the effectiveness of social media marketing to increase customer growth by engaging influencers on Twitter and Instagram platforms. This quantitative research utilizes Naïve Bayes (NB), Support Vector Machine (SVM), and Long Short-Term Memory Recurrent Neural Network (LSTM-RNN) algorithms in the modeling process for machine learning-based sentiment analysis. This research also uses social network analysis to determine the main actors who have the greatest influence by measuring four centrality values namely degree centrality, closeness centrality, betweenness centrality, and eigenvector centrality (Andrian, 2022).

Meanwhile, research with a qualitative approach that examines the interactions that occur between influencers and their followers is a study entitled “Participatory Culture in Tourism Digital Marketing Communication Channels” written by Riris Loisa et al. (2021) from the Faculty of Communication Sciences, Tarumanagara University. In this research with the netnography method, it describes the participatory culture in digital tourism marketing communication during the pandemic, through the Instagram social media channel of micro-influencers with their followers. The analytical knife used is Participatory Media Culture Theory from Henry Jenkins, to examine the content of three micro-influencer Instagram accounts (Loisa et al., 2021).

Methods

This research was conducted using a qualitative approach and virtual ethnography research method. This choice was based on the fact that the researcher wanted to examine the interaction between travel influencers and their followers through the content produced by travel influencers and the views obtained by their followers through discussions in the comments column of two female travel influencer accounts from Indonesia. The virtual ethnography method is considered appropriate to be able to get a detailed picture of virtual communities because this method is able to analyze the reasons behind a behaviour or sentiment in society. In fact, virtual ethnography is described as traditional ethnography adapted to online communities (Kozinet 2002 dalam Skågeby, 2011).

The unit of analysis is two female travel influencer Instagram accounts from Indonesia, which are named as the Top 10 Indonesian Travel Influencers 2023 by Singapore-based Influencer Marketing & Social-Media advertising agency, INSG.CO. The two Instagram accounts are @puannindya which has 479 thousand followers and @medinakamil with 244 thousand followers. Each influencer has a different character (INSG.co, 2023).
The @puannindya account is owned by a woman whose real name is Putri Anindya who has a hobby of taking pictures since childhood. Her Instagram content is mostly filled with photos of natural scenery. Meanwhile, the owner of the @medinakamil account is Medina Kamil, a former presenter of adventure shows on television, who often travels with her husband and two children.

![Figure 1: Instagram Account Views @puannindya and @medinakamil](Source: Author's Documentation)

The use of the Instagram platform in this research is also not without reason. According to data from digital research institutes We Are Social and Meltwater titled "Digital 2023" quoted from the Datareportal.com website, the total population in Indonesia in January 2023 was 276.4 million with 212.9 million internet users. This means that there has been an internet penetration of 77% in Indonesia in early 2023. In the same period, the number of active social media users in Indonesia was 167 million or around 60.4% of the total population. Of this number, 119.9 million are Facebook users with 55.4% being the eligible audience over the age of 13, who are exposed to ads on Facebook. Unfortunately, this platform is becoming less popular as marketers see a decline of 7.2 million Facebook users between October 2022 and January 2023.

The second most popular platform in Indonesia is YouTube, which reached 139 million users in early 2023. Although the number is quite large, the ad exposure rate on YouTube only reaches 50.3% of this number. Next, the Instagram platform is the choice of Indonesians. In early 2023, the number of Instagram users in Indonesia was recorded at 89.15 million. Although the number is relatively the smallest compared to the previous two platforms, the report states that 41.2% of the total number of users fall into the eligible audience group who are over 13 years old and can be targeted by advertisements. The picture above shows that Instagram users are quite active and have considerable potential in digital marketing activities (Datareportal.com, 2023)

The data collection technique in this study was carried out using online observation and digital data collection from the comment column of 2 travel influencer Instagram accounts during the period January to March 2023. Data analysis techniques carried out by researchers in conducting research based on this virtual ethnography method are 3, namely: 1) Elicitation stage, namely raw data collection; 2) Reduction stage which consists of 3 stages, namely: a) Selection, where researchers make simple categories and a list of unique words from these various comments; b) Coding, where researchers determine codes that are derived...
from the chosen theory along with a list of words from the comments that have been collected; c) Clustering, which is the process of categorizing data so that several discussion themes appear in the comment column related to the chosen theory. Furthermore, the last stage is 3) Visualization stage, where researchers conduct analysis based on the dimensions and patterns obtained from the previous stages (Skågeby, 2011).

Retrieval of comment data throughout the specified period was done using the IGCommentExporter program (E. Nogra, 2020). While the data analysis process will be assisted by the Voyant Tools program (Thung et al., 2021). Furthermore, the discussion themes that emerged from the findings will be discussed with the previously discussed concept of Cyberculture.

Results and Discussion

Elicitation Stage

Raw data collection is carried out by collecting online data from uploads and comments on Instagram social media accounts during the January-March 2023 period, which is considered the momentum for the revival of Indonesian tourism after the pandemic. At this stage, 9 uploads, 237 comments and 21,875 likes were collected from the @medinakamil account. Meanwhile, the @puanindya account collected 26 uploads, 714 comments and 479 likes.

Figure 2: Raw data from the comments column of 2 Instagram Travel Influencer accounts @medinakamil and @puanindya (Source: Researcher Processed Results)

Reduction Stage

In this stage, three stages were carried out to determine the choice of unique words and associated with the major themes found in the comment column, namely the selection, coding and clustering stages. In the selection stage, the researcher eliminated words that had no meaning. In the coding stage, the researcher linked the words to the appropriate themes. While in the clustering stage, researchers grouped the major themes found.

After eliminating meaningless words, in the selection stage, researchers found 94 unique words on the @medinakamil account and 74 unique words on the @puanindya account. Then the coding process was carried out to select the meaning or major themes in these unique words. As a result, 4 themes were found in the @medinakamil account with the following details: 1) Emotion (with a frequency of occurrence of 34 times); 2) The impact of information dissemination (22 times); 3)
Relationships established (62 times), and 4) Tourism information (34 times). Meanwhile, the @puaninndya account found 3 themes in the discussion column, with details: 1) Emotions (152 times); 2) Appreciation (51 times); 3) various products (23). From the coding results, researcher clustered 7 major themes found in the two travel influencer Instagram accounts from January to March 2023.

Figure 3: Selection-coding-clusterization data from the comments column of 2 Instagram Travel Influencer accounts @medinakamil and @puanindya (Source: Researcher's Process)

Visualization Stage

In this research, the results of Voyant Tools used are word cloud, reader, trends and summary (most frequent words) for each travel influencer account.

Figure 4: Visualization of keyword data from the comments column of the Instagram Travel Influencer @medinakamil account
(Source: Researcher's Process)

On the @medinakamil account, there were 167 total words that appeared in the comment section during January-March 2023 with 94 unique words. The amount of vocabulary density or the size of the appearance of each word in this comment column is 0.56 percent of the total number of all words, with the most frequent unique word appearing is "beautiful."

http://dx.doi.org/10.24912/jk.v15i1.18152
On the @puanindya account, there were 236 total words that appeared in the comments column during January - March 2023 with 76 unique words. The amount of vocabulary density or the size of the appearance of each word in this comment column is 0.32 percent of the total number of all words, with the most frequent unique word appearing is "thanks."

**Discussion**

From the findings above, there are 7 clusters of themes in the discussion column on the Instagram social media accounts of 2 Indonesian female travel influencers, namely @medinakamil and @puanindya. Each account has similarities and differences in discussion themes in the comments column throughout the period January - March 2023.

On the @medinakamil account, there are 94 unique words, most of which are themed on the relationship between followers and their idol influencers. As is known, the woman whose real name is Medina Kamil was formerly the presenter of the television program Jejak Petualang which premiered in 2003. She is known as an adventurer and has many fans. Now, Medina is a mother of two daughters who likes to travel nature with her family and likes to share it on social media.

Her past as a public figure has helped her increase her engagement rate, attract followers, collect likes and spark lively discussions in the comments section. According to Social Blade social media statistics page, the @medinakamil account has an engagement rate of 1.1%, which means followers are less comfortable interacting with the travel influencer's products or content. This number is still insufficient because the average engagement rate on Instagram is 1.6%. This means that if the engagement rate is not good, there may be some elements of the user experience that need to be improved.

Many followers still reminisce about her past. Comments contain keywords related to the relationship between followers and the influencer such as "adventurous trail", "idol", "miss", as well as keywords affiliated with happy emotions such as "beautiful" and "cool". Besides contributing to the engagement rate, this is also the reason why this account always manages to get a lot of likes, even though there are not many comments on each post. In one post with 53 comments—which she often doesn't reply to-Medina was able to get 5,323 likes. Another post that 'only' received 12 comments, was also able to gain 1065 likes.
In the concept of Cyberculture, the figure of travel influencer Medina Kamil is favoured by internet society. This is evidenced by the number of likes buttons she gets in almost every upload even though she only gets a few comments. This is because Medina never replies to comments on each of her uploads, so that her followers can only talk to their idols virtually, as well as make observations about the idol's daily interactions in cyberspace, both materially and socially.

Medina's figure as a travel influencer is proven to be able to mobilize masses of cyber followers thanks to the relationships established from the celebrity's past. This is indicated by the number of keywords related to past memories (62 times). However, as a travel influencer, Medina does not seem to be able to have a strong influence because it is evident that the keywords in the comments column related to tourism information only amounted to 34 times and the words related to the impact of the information dissemination she provided through uploads were only around 22 times. This can be considered a shortcoming of this influencer account, where her content and figure are widely liked but have not been able to provide value to her followers.

Meanwhile, on @puanindya account, the most mentioned keywords in the discussion column are those with emotional themes to express admiration for the beauty of the uploaded tours, namely 152 times. Keywords such as "love", "beautiful", "cool", "great", "like" and "good", reflect the impression of followers of this account when they see content that they find interesting, whether the content is related to tourist destinations or product endorsements. In addition, appreciation-themed keywords such as "thank you", "merci", "thanks" and "danke" were also found 52 times.

This was mainly obtained from the account owner's response when replying to comments from his followers who appreciated the uploaded content. The various responses of gratitude conveyed by the account owner show the personal closeness between travel influencers and their followers. It is clear that the account owner is trying to maintain a good relationship with his followers, by responding to comments and paying attention to his followers' comments.
Looking at her background, the account owner @puanindya is a woman whose real name is Putri Anindya. Her educational background from the journalism department combined with her photography skills, makes her now popular in the digital realm because she often introduces the beauty of Indonesia to the outside world. Not surprisingly, the various uploads of this woman who is familiarly called Puan are mostly filled with natural scenery, both foreign and domestic.

The number of followers on the Instagram account is quite high, which is almost 500 thousand followers, making the @puanindya account worthy of being considered as macro influencers to promote goods. However, each of her uploads from January to Wednesday 2023 only received 3 likes. However, there was one post that received 404 likes during that period, which was a post about romance in Paris, France. From the comments column, it is clear how many of her followers appreciate commenting on the uploaded content. Interestingly, every comment that comes in will be replied to by the account owner himself even if it only mentions "merci", "danke" or "thank you."

In the concept of Cyberculture, this is what is called cyberspace or virtual world that allows individuals to connect in a virtual space. Travel influencers and their followers have the freedom to show their identity without being real. The representation of symbols represented by images, texts and stories is clearly visible in uploads that harvest many likes. Described in the upload, the scene that took place in the most romantic city in the world coincided with Valentine's Day on February 14. Putri was able to capture the special moments of romantic couples, represented by flowers that represent love. The narrative in this content was then captured by her followers so that they gave many special likes to this upload.

In addition, the appreciative response delivered by Putri in response to the admiration directed at her and the content she uploaded, is a form of representation of self-identity as an individual who holds eastern traditional values. When given praise, those who are given praise must reciprocate by saying thank you. It seems that the values of identity as an individual who does not forget the roots is what Putri really maintains, even in a cyberspace.
Conclusion

This study found that in the period January to March 2023 on 2 Instagram accounts of travel influencers @medinakamil and @puanindya, there were no discussions whose contents questioned the validity of information uploaded on social media. The majority of the discussion content in the comment column of the two travel influencers contains the followers' admiration for the uploaded content material, both photos and videos, and also the credibility of the account owner in the past. What is interesting in the findings of this study, there are two different interactions from each travel influencer account follower. On @medinakamil's Instagram account, almost all posts in that period received many likes even though they only received a few comments. The account owner also never responded to the crowd in the comment column. Another case with the @puanindya Instagram account, where the account owner almost always responds to comments that appear on all uploads in that period, the majority by mentioning the word "thank you." From this, it can be concluded that interactions in cyberspace and the real world feel close and can be practiced simultaneously. Cybertecture that appears on social media is a form of culture in real life.

Acknowledgement

On this occasion, the author would like to thank the Education Fund Management Institution (LPDP) of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Indonesia for the financial support provided during the study period. The author would also like to thank the Rector of Universitas Tarumanagara where the author works as a lecturer, and the Rector of Universitas Indonesia where the author studies, for the opportunity given to undergo further studies.

References


http://dx.doi.org/10.24912/jk.v15i1.18152


