

Yuliana Rakhmawati:
Cultural Shifting And Non-Verbal Communication Reconstruction In Covid-19 Outbreak:
Indonesia'S Insight
Pergeseran Budaya Dan Rekonstruksi Komunikasi Non-Verbal Pada Pandemi Covid-19 Di
Indonesia

Cultural Shifting And Non-Verbal Communication Reconstruction In Covid-19 Outbreak: Indonesia'S Insight

Pergeseran Budaya Dan Rekonstruksi Komunikasi Non-Verbal Pada Pandemi Covid-19 Di Indonesia

Yuliana Rakhmawati

Program Studi Ilmu Komunikasi, Universitas Trunojoyo Madura, Jl. Raya Telang PO.BOX 2-
Bangkalan, East Java, Indonesia*
E-mail: yuliana.r@trunojoyo.ac.id

Masuk tanggal : 16-04-2021, revisi tanggal : 13-11-2021, diterima untuk diterbitkan tanggal : 29-11-2021

Abstract

COVID 19 has had a multidisciplinary impact on health, economic, and socio-political emergencies. In the context of communal culture, the impact is increasingly felt. Various activities that prioritize collectivity become limited and even eliminated. In general, communal people used to handle certain messages with physical touch. During the pandemic, conversely, non-verbal activity are in a shifting mode. Therefore, this research attempt to identifies interaction patterns changes in collective society addressing the new habit in non-verbal communication perspectives. This research uses literature studies on journals, previous studies, and other textual documents that are relevant to the research objectives. The analysis results were discussed by the Birdwhistell kinesics theory and Hall's proxemics theory. The research obtained the discussion about non-verbal communication patterns shifting from the haptic tradition to mediated communication. Furthermore, the discussion also apply to physical distance in space and time theory outlook. Therefore, in collective society, the changes will not only generate a new culture but also deliver the way of thinking shifting. The communication barriers presence in indexical signs use then likely happened. Further research could emphasize on macro levels in language relativity perspective. The use of positivistic paradigms to explain correlations between population characteristics and changes in communication behavior patterns during a pandemic can also be explored.

Keywords: *communal, kinesic, non-verbal communication, proxemics*

Abstrak

COVID 19 memiliki dampak multidisiplin pada kesehatan, ekonomi, dan keadaan darurat sosial-politik. Dalam konteks budaya komunal, dampaknya semakin terasa. Berbagai kegiatan yang mengedepankan kebersamaan menjadi terbatas bahkan dihilangkan. Pada umumnya orang komunal biasa menangani pesan tertentu dengan sentuhan fisik. Selama pandemi, sebaliknya, aktivitas non verbal mengalami pergeseran dalam pola penggunaan dalam interaksi. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengidentifikasi perubahan pola interaksi dalam masyarakat kolektif yang menyikapi adaptasi kebiasaan baru dalam perspektif komunikasi non-verbal. Penelitian ini menggunakan studi literatur pada jurnal, penelitian sebelumnya, dan dokumen tekstual lainnya yang relevan dengan tujuan penelitian. Hasil analisis dibahas dengan teori kinesik Birdwhistell dan teori proksemik Hall. Dari

penelitian didapatkan pembahasan tentang pergeseran pola komunikasi non-verbal dari tradisi haptic ke komunikasi termediasi. Selanjutnya pembahasan juga berlaku untuk jarak fisik dalam pandangan teori ruang dan waktu. Oleh karena itu, dalam masyarakat kolektif, perubahan tidak hanya akan melahirkan budaya baru tetapi juga melahirkan pergeseran pola pikir. Dalam konteks ini masyarakat dan komunikasi dilihat dalam perspektif resiprosikal. Hambatan komunikasi yang terdapat pada penggunaan tanda indeksik kemungkinan besar terjadi. Penelitian lebih lanjut dapat menekankan pada level makro dalam perspektif relativitas bahasa. Penggunaan paradigma positivistik untuk menjelaskan korelasi antara karakteristik populasi dan perubahan pola perilaku komunikasi selama pandemi juga dapat dieksplorasi.

Kata Kunci: komunal, kinesik, komunikasi non-verbal, proksemik

Introduction

As of mid-early July 2020, the number of positive cases of COVID-19 in Indonesia reached more than 65.000, the recovery rate reached 28.000, and the mortality rate above 3.000 (Covid-19.go.id, 2020). Therefore, reading these numerical statistics will provide a variety of perspectives. In the health emergency dimension, the pandemic implicates health facilities and other supporting facilities readiness. Moreover, in the economic context, the pandemic caused a significant effect (Hanoatubun 2020). Some regulations such as lockdown policy (Yunus and Rezki 2020); a stay-at-home campaign (Khasanah, Pramudibyanto, and Widuroyeki 2020); generate several business activities cessation (Umar 2020). Global macroeconomics is also experiencing disruption due to viruses' evolution, where the authorities find it difficult to formulate the right regulations to overcome (McKibbin and Fernando 2020).

The education sector is also affected by the massive spread of the COVID-19 virus. Data from UNESCO shows that more than 290.5 million students worldwide experience a disruption in learning activities due to schools' closure (Purwanto et al. 2020). The education providers' responses vary, from not responding to those who implement campus isolation strategies and developing curricula to support online learning (Crawford et al. 2020). This implication occurs with various educational institutions' shifts: replacing face-to-face classic tutorials with online learning (Firman and Rahayu 2020). Various innovations are made to continue to carry out learning effectively (Gunawan, Suranti, and Fathoroni 2020).

Therefore, Indonesia's government issued some regulations to reduce the COVID-19 spread number. The authorities have issued several policies, such as: conducting distance learning in the education sector (Pragholapati 2020); (Abidah et al. 2020), establishing a large-scale area limitation (Setiati and Azwar 2020), launched a mitigation guide to accelerate the COVID-19 handling crisis (Djalante et al. 2020). This step was accompanied by government management in carrying out effective public communication (Azhar 2020).

The application of physical boundaries or physical distancing makes the increasing necessity of technology contribution as a communication channel (Komalasari 2020). Mass media has also become a socially and culturally channel in mitigating public awareness education against COVID-19 (Sampurno, Kusumandyoko, and Islam 2020). The COVID-19 epidemic spread prevention obligates the government, with all community entities, public figures, religious leaders, to mitigate COVID-19 (Syafriada 2020).

From December 2019 to March 2020, the bibliographic survey found more than 1,500 publications of communication articles discussing COVID-19 (Darsono, Rohmana, and Busro 2020). Some of the previous research on COVID-19 in Indonesia has looked at various perspectives. Satellite technology contributes to the health dimension by mitigating the COVID-19's spread (Suryaatmadja and Maulani 2020). Research on the distribution of COVID-19 information found misinformation related to news narratives consumed by the public (Nasir, Baequni, and Nurmansyah 2020). Therefore, local government relations functions contribute to strengthening COVID-19's mitigation (Khairani 2020). Academicians also obligate in social responsibility to conduct research studies around COVID-19 (Hamid 2020).

Furthermore, the extraordinary COVID-19 incident mitigation was also initiated from a religious approach perspective (Muhyiddin et al. 2020). The authorities' regulatory for religious activities limitation resulted in changes in worship patterns (Darmawan et al. 2020). Formerly, religious activities tended to be collective in open spaces. Previously, with social restrictions, the activity becoming more personal in private spaces. Moreover, Indonesian society's social communication patterns change during pandemic partly determined by social prejudice or stigma on COVID 19's survivor (Dani and Mediantara 2020). It is an implied recommendation for Indonesian authorities to optimizing public diplomacy management due to COVID-19 crisis mitigation (Martha 2020).

Indonesian society is built with strong collectivity values. Individual identity is elaborate on the roots of the social-cultural dimension (Hidayat 2014). Various community activities are carried out in an open and gathered atmosphere, such as religious, cultural, and social rituals. Indonesian establish the non-verbal language on a communal cultural foundation such as in the Eid homecoming tradition (Arribathi and Aini 2018), in mediated catholic mass (Tonggo and Irwansyah 2021), apart from various motive constructions (Irianto 2012). Physical touch and closeness are indices of the warmth of relationships in this society (Vrij, Hartwig, and Granhag 2019); (Xu, Staples, and Shen 2012). Non-verbal activity such as eye gaze also determines the degree of closeness of interpersonal relationships (Vogel, Meyer, and Harendza 2018). Nevertheless, new habitual adaptation regulations, "Adaptasi Kebiasaan Baru," demonstrate collectivism in Indonesian society must be shifted. The physical closeness and warmth built in the context of time and space in a society with a vulnerable collective culture with a high context communication are interesting to be explored in the application of adopting new habits during the extraordinary events of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Ray Birdwhistell mentions communication as a dynamic structured process associated with multi-channels living systems that regulate multisensory activity and become a determinant of the message transfer process (Birdwhistell 1990). Birdwhistell is a scientist who explores social interactions and nonverbal behavior to become known as kinesics or body movements studies (Littlejohn and Foss 2009). The study of kinesics involves the meaning of human body movements as symbolic or metaphorical social interactions. Kinesics include facial expressions, gestures, posture and gait, hand, and body movements (Goldin-Meadow and Alibali 2013). Expressive movements are treated as symbolic actions representing thoughts, feelings, moods, goals, attitudes, or a combination of these with verbal communication. Share communication value, body activities must be changed to be conventional or generally understood (Jolly 2000). Although most non-verbal communication acts as arbitrators symbolically diverse, some have icons that can be understood universally. Non-verbal message research shows that even though the body movement is complex, it can be learned and predicted.

The body movements are constructed in various cultural contexts differ. This pattern results in the finding of dominant body posture forms in certain cultures and individuals acting in the group's context. Furthermore, kinesics theory has seven assumptions: (1) all body movements have a potential meaning in the context of communication; (2) behavior can be analyzed because it is organized and can be the subject of a systematic analysis; (3) the use of bodily activities has biological limitations, but is an essential part of the social system; (4) different groups pretend to use different gestures; (5) body activities function in communication can be investigated; (6) finding meaning in kinesic studies requires adequate corpus, and appropriate methods; and (7) gesture is individual but involving social system (Birdwhistell 1990).

Edward T Hall introduced territorial concepts of space and time in non-verbal communication studies as proxemics (Knap, Hall, and Horgan 2014). Proxemics explains the relationship between human behavior and the concept of individual distance (Littlejohn and Foss 2009). Owen Hargie and David Dickson have identified the proxemics concept of territorial in four forms. The main territory refers to owners' exclusive space used where no one else can enter except with the owner's permission. The second territory is almost like the first territory but permits particular space sharing. The public territory enables a certain period of space sharing, such as a parking lot or reading room in a library. Interaction territory is a space created by other people when interacting in groups (Littlejohn and Foss 2009). Space variations occur in use because there is a contribution to differences in self-definition. Individuals in certain cultures organize space in specific ways.

Furthermore, Hall defines three basic forms of space. Fixed-feature space consists of unremoved or permanent physical items such as walls and rooms. Semifixed-feature space includes movable objects such as furniture, cutlery, cooking utensils, et cetera. Informal space is individuals' personal space that is constructed when interacting with other people. For example, in an Anglo-American cultural context, several distances are used: intimate (0-46 cm), private

(0.5 to 1.5 m), social (1.5 to 3.5 m), and public distance (3, 5 m). Distance making by individuals is influenced by gender, status, and social role (Littlejohn and Foss 2008).

Nonverbal communication study is specifically divided into three forms: haptic, oculusics, and chronemics. Haptics is the study of touch, including shaking hands, holding hands, kissing, slapping, embracing, and wrapping arms. Haptic behavior use adapter sign to send messages that express the communicator's intent or feelings. Touch can convey a myriad of meanings, from messages of care and concern to anger and violence. In communal culture, physical touch is an indicator of various messages depending on the situation and conditions where and when the touch is done.

Oculusics is a study of non-verbal communication related to the role of the eye. Eye contact can be an index of liking, attention, and involvement. Gaze consists of the act of seeing while speaking, seeing while listening, the number of gazes, and the frequency of views, fixation patterns, pupil dilation, and blink rate. All of these activities must be understood in an appropriate cultural context. Chronemics is a nonverbal communication dimension related to the use of time. The concept of time varies from culture to culture. Gudykunst and Ting-Toomey identified two dominant time patterns: monochronic time and polychronic time. Monochronic time schedules (M-time) refer to cultures and contexts where time is considered very important and is characterized by a linear pattern. The M-pattern is commonly found in North America and Northern Europe. Another pattern is called a polychronic (P-time) in which personal involvement is more important than the schedule. The P-time pattern is commonly found in Latin America and the Middle East (Burgoon, Guerrero, and Floyd 2016).

Indonesia has become a portrait of a communal society with an identical characteristic attachment. In personal identity construction, it cannot be separated from the fulfillment of the collectivity's identity (Roslidah and Komara 2017). Communal societies prefer members' physical presence in conducting activities, and the involvement is based on biological characteristics categorization, geographical proximity, and cultural background affiliation. This society shows high cohesivity but low-level conflict, develops a homogeneous culture, even though in some regional context such as geographical characteristics, the differences occur (Martin and Nakayama 2010).

Communal societies develop broad moral networks. The society's members obligate to support other members, have nuclear and extended family involvement. Friends and social environment shape neighborhood fulfillment. In the Indonesian context, collectivity is evident with the social systems in the Rukun Tetangga (RT) and Rukun Warga (RW). Furthermore, collectivity is carried out in voluntary involvement as a part of social networks' instrumental models. The mechanical solidarity that is formed confirms community members with limited space to form permanent factions. The communal society prioritizes conflict avoidance as an indicator of an effective system.

Quality emphasizing and status degree took form in collectivism responsibility expression (Vijver 2017). These societies notice the community norms with obedience value and participation with or without personal commitment. Confrontation rarely is done openly or in aggressive behavior form. The collectivity is indexed by the closeness of physical behavior among community members. The power of touch becomes one medium to convey effective communication (Park and Park 2018).

Non-verbal communication conveys personal messages in forming individuals' roles and social attribute distribution patterns (Saunderson and Nejat 2019). The dynamics of social interaction experienced by community members do not necessarily make the collective society more open. Encoding pattern changes and channel shifting in communication are possible, but it is maintained contextual substance. The individual learned to carry thought, feeling, and potential behavior within the self throughout the entire life. Learning and assimilation skill patterns are found since early childhood (Martin and Nakayama 2010).

Collective societies build affirmations with shared rituals, celebrate collective identification, and carry out political mobilization. Singer (1987) define culture as learning patterns, group-related perceptions - including attitudes, verbal and nonverbal language values, belief systems, distrust systems, and behavior (Martin and Nakayama 2010). The concept of culture can be used to identify symbolic behavior and its perceived meaning. Meaning occurs collectively among members of the cultural group. The communal society's cultural pattern defines physical presence as a form of affirmation of its cultural affiliation as good as morning coffee community members gathering. The mechanical collectivity construction becomes an ideal portrait, even though it can be explored more in-depth symbolic significance level. Public spaces go beyond as a medium to share individuals feeling as a cultural members.

The collectivity in all other public activities is also seen in birth, marriage, and death rituals. Also, all spiritualism ritual activities tend to be carried out collectively. The cultural pattern qualify activities with group members commonly symbolic significance. This identity search is carried out in meaningful activities in relativity the same way for every member. Furthermore, all participants must have access to a forced or voluntary action pattern (Martin and Nakayama 2010). Culture becomes a group world construction where some curtain societies govern the world created in a certain way over time. This framework or meaning network enables society members to understand themselves, the world, and their experiences in that world. These shared realities give common knowledge and experience to individuals in a particular culture. Some collective activity fosters the same perception of understanding the world. Self-identity in a collective culture unites individuals within a collective frame of reference, which is the domain of the community (Samovar, Porter, and McDaniel 2010).

Collectivity values tend to build a personal identity with social roles bond. Individuals' motivation fulfillment, therefore, is also attached to this construction. The collective society applies language as a channel to convey a message and build identity construction. Despite the world view understanding medium, language prevails in a high communication context. From a semantic perspective, the use of language is carried out verbally and nonverbally. Even though these two language methods could be used in partial or convergent communication, the nonverbal seem to dominate in the collective community.

Adhere to new normal regulation adaptation, collectivism, and communalism reconstruction is needed. Indonesian society's collectivity pattern faced a dynamic challenge during the COVID-19 outbreak. Some previous communication research on COVID-19 was dominated by the contribution of changing communication patterns from offline to media or online (Firman and Rahayu 2020; Khasanah et al. 2020; Komalasari 2020; Suryaatmadja and Maulani 2020). Meanwhile, another research found that the public sphere of multicultural communities, which is directly used as a channel for delivering messages, has shifted to virtual barrier attachment (Kurniawan, Yumna, and Tantri 2020). Therefore, this research attempts to discuss the absence and shifting of some non-verbal messages in Indonesian communal communication during the COVID-19 outbreak.

This research conduction is essential to describe the pandemic context and engage the dialogue in understanding the communication phenomenon, particularly in non-verbal communication. The research gained evidence from research topics relevant to the pandemic outbreak selective literature review, including work on communication mitigation and social-cultural consideration. In each section, discussion notice prior research nature and quality as an insight for adequate discussion and highlight critical finding to COVID-19 pandemic and communication. Furthermore, the finding could initiate preliminary research on scientific insights in gaining an accurate and deep understanding of COVID-19 outbreak regulation implications on communication scholars' perspectives.

Methods

The research design used the systematic literature review (SLR) method. SLR is a research method that can systematically reproduce, identify, select, and critically assess all relevant literature (Fink 2014). This design work as a technical tool to review formulated research questions (Wahono 2016). Data collection techniques in SLR use documentation .

Literature searches with keywords: COVID-19, physical distancing, public stigma, stay-at-home policy, prevention of transmission, new cases of public health, and Indonesia carried out as sampling methods. This research obtained relevant literature data collection with Google Scholars. This research employed several of SLR's protocols from Saltikov with some adjustment. Research systematic stages referring to the model (Saltikov 2012) as shown in the following table 1:

Table 1. SLR Protocol in research

Phase	Operational	Output
Formulate research questions	It is used to guide the process of searching and extracting literature as well as to show state-of-the-art research of a research topic.	The question from this research is: "how was the collective society and communal culture during COVID-19 from the perspective of nonverbal communication?"
Define literature criteria	Determine the type of literature and the characteristics of the literature. In this research, the type of literature is determined to be journal and seminar proceedings in 2020 with the keywords AND Indonesia nonverbal communication, COVID-19 And Indonesia, and the collective community of AND Indonesia.	These criteria are used for searches with the help of search engine channels on the internet.
Data collection technique	Perform documentation procedures from predetermined keywords using Google scholar. To simplify this process, it is recommended that we create criteria that function as filters in the selection and rejection of a literature (inclusion and exclusion criteria).	A total of 73 articles were found from national, international journals, and national and international seminar proceedings. From these results then extracted with additional criteria, namely the national journal SINTA 1 or SINTA 2, and indexed international journals. This process is abstracted in 7 articles.
Data Analysis	The data obtained were then analyzed using narrative analysis.	From 7 articles then analyzed using narrative analysis.
Synthesis, summarizing, and presenting findings	The main purpose of data synthesis is to analyze and evaluate various research results from various literatures, and to select the most appropriate method to integrate the explanation and interpretation of these findings.	The results of research analysis need to be discussed and discussed with theories or concepts that are in accordance with the research object. The findings from the literature analysis are discussed with the concept of nonverbal communication, proxemics theory and kinesics
Discussion of findings	Research findings need to be discussed with other literature as well as analyzed for later discussion.	Research reports and dissemination in the form of publications.

Source: processed by the researcher (2020)

Results And Discussion

In this study, seventy-three documents were found as literature population coding with the protocol's keywords. Furthermore, the literature document is extracted with the following criteria: published year 2020, published by indexed publishing institutions (national SINTA 1 or 2 journal rank) and international (Scopus indexes). This process got seven literature as the unit analysis of the discussion. The following table shows the analysis and abstraction of seven journal literature.

Table 2. Abstract of Research Findings Article 1

Title	Handling Of Public Stigma On COVID-19 In Indonesian Society (Sulistiadi, Rahayu, & Harmani, 2020)
Journal	Kesmas: Jurnal Kesehatan Masyarakat Nasional (National Public Health Journal). 2020; Special Issue 1: 70-76 (SINTA 1)
Keywords	communication, COVID-19, education, information, public stigma
Abstraction	This research qualitatively examines the stigma associated with COVID-19. Lack of correct and precise understanding of the pandemic has led to the stigma of COVID 19 by the public. The implications of this research suggest that the government, media and related parties provide adequate information, education and communication related to COVID-19.

Source: research analysis (2020)

Table 3. Abstract of Research Findings Article 2

Title	Challenges Of Stay-At-Home Policy Implementation During The Coronavirus (COVID-19) Pandemic In Indonesia (Setyawan & Lestari, 2020)
Journal	Jurnal Administrasi Kesehatan Indonesia Vol 8 No 1 Special Issue 2020 (SINTA 2)
Keywords	COVID-19, Indonesia, stay-at-home policy
Abstraction	This article discusses the regulation of social distancing and all its implications for people's lives. The policy of limiting interactions with stay from home requires adequate management from the government and related parties to provide guarantees for the mental health and welfare of the affected community.

Source: research analysis (2020)

Table 4. Abstract of Research Findings Article 3

Title	Community Knowledge, Attitudes, And Behavior Towards Social Distancing Policy As A Means Of Preventing Transmission Of COVID-19 In Indonesia (Yanti & et.al, 2020) (Ardan, Rahman, & Geroda, 2020)
-------	--

Journal	Jurnal Administrasi Kesehatan Indonesia Vol 8 No 1 Special Issue 2020 (SINTA 2)
Keywords	attitudes, behavior, COVID-19, knowledge, social distancing
Abstraction	The results of this research show that the Indonesian public has sufficient knowledge, attitudes and behavior about social distancing. An understanding of the virus transmission prevention mechanism supports disaster mitigation strategies to control the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia

Source: research analysis (2020)

Table 5. Abstract of Research Findings Article 4

Title	Positive Correlation Between General Public Knowledge and Attitudes Regarding COVID-19 Outbreak 1 Month After First Cases Reported in Indonesia (Sari & et.al, 2020)
Journal	Journal of Community Health (Scopus Q1 SJR 0,72)
Keywords	prevention of transmission; COVID-19 response, new cases of public health
Abstraction	This quantitative descriptive research found that there was positive knowledge and attitudes about the COVID-19 pandemic. Although there are still a few who have a negative attitude towards the recommendation to maintain a minimum distance of 1.5 m in the crowd and cannot exercise regularly and provide nutritious food.

Source: research analysis (2020)

Table 6. Abstract of Research Findings Article 5

Title	Understanding of Young People About COVID-19 During Early Outbreak in Indonesia (Halim & et.al, 2020)
Journal	Asia Pacific Journal of Public Health 1 –3 (Scopus Q2 SJR 0,55)
Keywords	COVID-19, coronavirus, outbreak, young people, understanding, knowledge, Indonesia
Abstraction	This research used online data collection based cross sectional data on adolescents aged 10-25 years with 10 questions. The findings from the research show that there is a lack of understanding of respondents on items of preventive measures such as hand washing habits and physical distancing.

Source: research analysis (2020)

Table 7. Abstract of Research Findings Article 6

Title	COVID-19 and Indonesia (Setiati & Azwar, 2020)
Journal	Acta Med Indones - Indonesia J Intern Med Vol 52 Number 1 January 2020 (Scopus Q3 SJR 0,35)
Keywords	COVID-19, SARS-CoV-2, coronavirus, Indonesia
Abstraction	Using the literature method of this research study, the findings and implications for reducing the epidemic peak by tightening calls for stay from home, improving health services, and quarantining areas significantly limit the doubling time of the epidemic.

Source: research analysis (2020)

Table 8. Abstract of Research Findings Article 7

Title	The Influence Of Physical Distance To Student Anxiety On COVID-19, Indonesia
Journal	Journal of Critical Reviews VOL 7, ISSUE 17, 2020 (Scopus Index)
Keywords	COVID-19, Physical Distance, Student Anxiety
Abstraction	Data collection using the Hamilton Rating Scale (HRA) instrument found that the rate of anxiety on the issue of COVID 19 on indicators of exposure and physical distancing was relatively high among school students. Psychosocial well-being management is needed during a pandemic to maintain mental health even in physical distancing settings.

Source: research analysis (2020)

The coding results above indicate that all articles have a common keyword as COVID-19. Additional keywords vary from communication, education, information, public stigma, Indonesia, stay-at-home policy, attitudes, behavior, knowledge, social distancing, prevention of transmission, response, public health, young people, understanding, knowledge, SARS-CoV-2, coronavirus, physical distance, and anxiety. Article 3,4,5 and 7 journal abstract uses a positivistic perspective in studying the issue of the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia. Whereas articles 1,2, and 6 use the interpretive perspective in revealing the COVID-19 theme in Indonesia.

There were two various implications themes found carried out from narrative analysis relate to the COVID-19 issue. Inadequate and sufficient understanding of COVID-19 has an impact on delivering COVID-19's stigma (found in article 1), lack of transmission prevention awareness with healthy living behaviors (found in article 5), and the student's anxiety in doing interactions (article 7). Meanwhile, physical distancing awareness and stay from home campaigns are found in articles 2, 3, 4, and 6. Each article has academic and practical implications, as stated in article 1, sufficient action can be a channel for education and communication on COVID-19 mitigation. Article 2 provides recommendations on mental health insurance provision and providing people affected by the policy with professional management.

Meanwhile, article 3 optimistically sees that sufficient knowledge and understanding of the public on the mechanism for preventing virus transmission supports the mitigation and control over the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia. Furthermore, articles 4 and 5 have implications for strengthening the Indonesian public's knowledge and understanding of COVID-19 to maintain distance and adapt to healthy behavior. Article 6 considers that improving health services and regional quarantine is one way to limit the epidemic's doubling time. Mitigation using psychosocial well-being management is the recommendation of article 7 to maintain students' mental health in physical restriction policies.

Collective Identity During COVID-19: Construction and Non-verbal Communication

Developing an individual's identity in a collective society cannot be separated from the closest social system. Self-introduction to life knowledge, affections, emotions (Puertas-Molero et al. 2018), and interactions starts from the communal circle. Identity in a collective society becomes an index of solidarity, built-in homogeneity nuances. The identity construction is carried out in various daily activities from private space such as religiosity to public space determination. Religious rituals also represent collective awareness implementation (Supriadi 2017).

Family and the social system tend to affect decisively Indonesians identity development (Hidayat 2014). Public space's use is determinative in a collective society, and the pattern governs relatively stability among generations. However, in the era of the COVID-19 pandemic, there were significant changes in the dynamics of public spaces use in Indonesia. The public space function shifting indicates the Indonesian society's communication pattern. This portrait is found in Journal articles 2, 3, 6, and 7 with findings on the alternative use of private spaces in building identity. The four articles mention the stay-at-home policy, social distancing, and physical distance. A shift from dimension closeness and warmth in public space use becomes mediated through virtual public space (Kurniawan et al. 2020). In this pandemic outbreak, collectivism is built not merely with communication participants' physical presence in a proxemics manner but also prioritizes health protocols consideration.

Space usage shifting becomes a notification on the dynamics communication channel. According to Edward Hall, space is a part of constructed communication that differ in cultural backgrounds (Littlejohn and Foss 2009). In some Western societies, space is defined as sight and hearing, while in other cultures, it is constructed with scents and appearance (Katsumi et al. 2017; Keogh 2014). Included in the concept of space is the presence of physical access restrictions. Furthermore, Hall mention that spaced relates to physical indexing boundaries that separate itself from the outside environment (Hall 1959). Hall calls the space in the study of non-verbal communication as proxemics. There are three types of space in Hall's Proxemics: fixed-feature space consists of permanent physical forms such as walls and rooms. Semi-fixed-feature spaces refer to temporary physical moved artifacts like furniture. Informal space determines an individual's convenience territory choice in some contexts. Those physical distances are generally considered by relationship degree. Private territory usually took intimate distance (0 to 45 cm), private distance (40 to 100 cm), social distance (1 meter-3 meter), and public distance (more than 3 meters).

During the COVID-19 pandemic, regulators delivered several policies to inhibit or break the virus transmission chain. The regulations are carried out by limiting physical distance to individual interactions, as discussed in articles 2, 3, 6, and 7. From a proxemics perspective, the territorial limitation will bring about a shift in the accompanying non-physical boundaries. This "new" proxemics space during the COVID-19 pandemic conveys as channels of solidarity, warmth, and empathy are limited in media communication. It implicates for physical

attributions shifting of the space presence function. This new interaction model delivers spatial context with the presence of posture, socio-sociopetal axis, kinesthetic factors, tactile behavior, visual code, code of consciousness, degree of feeling, and sound frequency with all adjustments.

Indonesian society has been constructing public spaces as part of identity formation. Interaction has been built by presenting non-verbal behavior with various body language or kinesics (Jolly 2000). The collectivism identity in the adaptation of new habits with all regulations limiting physical contact brings translation to emblems, illustrators, adapters, regulators, and affects displays. This type of non-verbal behavior will tend to be used by eliminating physical touch. The function of non-verbal communication in conveying messages also changes, not in substance but in the form of accompanying behavior.

Physical territories limitation regulation in communal culture creates social relations dialectic, emotional needs fulfillment compare to health side's urgency. The space limitation use generates culture shock since substitute signs references as a medium for conveying messages. Indonesian society used to conveyed warm conversation through kinesic signs such as direct touch, smile, and gesture shift to mediated communication. The intimate emotional message from dyadic direct face to face becomes more distant in separation. In education, offline classical classes are being asked to turn online. Meanwhile, in the context of social relations, restrictions on physical contact are also carried out. The limitation is not only on individual interaction with individuals but also on interaction participants in a particular setting.

Differences occur between natural collective culture and online culture made territorial adaptation patterns need to be reconstructed. Physical restrictions regulation should involve appropriate non-verbal message delivery as part of a new habit pattern. Nevertheless, it should also be realized that these differences are prone to lead to confrontation, both physically and psychologically. Communication barriers are also inclined to arise due to cultural differences in space concept construction (Hall 1968). Before the pandemic, Indonesian society stood "too close" in dialogue, meanwhile during the pandemic was asked to recreate a "comfortable distance" in interactions. The collective society re-identifies the signs as an index of affective and emotional messages. Therefore, distance becomes not understood as cold, aloof, attractive, or not interested in the interlocutor individual, but instead as a caring language for other entities.

This change causes a relatively homogeneous communication pattern in the use of proxemics and kinesics indices. There are inter-cultural agreements to adopt identical patterns of caring behavior (Lorié et al. 2017). The health dimension urgency becomes a unifier for changes in the adaptation of new habits. Regulations that make the distance between individuals make access to non-verbal communication more open. In this context, openness does not mean an opportunity for entropy to exist but instead becomes momentum for behavioral adjustment. Individuals' attitudes and actions as part of cultural commonality will intersect with individuals' public interactions. The collective culture could shapes individual potential has in strengthen broader communal solidarity. Group identity

in a collective society is reattached to the affirmation of local culture and become the origin when it comes to building universal communication patterns.

Kinesic and proxemic, as a part of non-verbal communication channels, are becoming more radical in use. The COVID-19 pandemic is taking communication into a new and heuristic form. According to Birdwhistell, communication refers to a dynamic process structured on the relationship to living systems. Multi channels of the system may appear to regulate multisensory activity and influence the operation of the system. In this context, the message as an element of communication should be integral, replacing the less productive dichotomy between verbal and nonverbal signs (Jolly 2000).

The use of a safety distance limitation with a figure of 1.5 meters in interaction and a tightening formulation on individual territories is a multi-channel option. Certain conditions, such as the COVID-19 pandemic, have made individuals in a collective society begin to learn about the physiology of messages. Communication elements are becoming universal movement patterns with broader and general understanding. The transmission could lead to international signs convergence. The signs compilation causes a complicated process and obligates for communication function carrying responsibility (Conley 2019).

Communal society and COVID-19: Culture as a symbolic pattern of Meaning

During COVID-19, the Indonesian community has experienced a non-verbal communication involvement shift. The shift occurs not only in message channels but also in the aspects of cognition, semantics, and meaning. Non-verbal communication has awareness and control in the intention conduction (Knap et al. 2014). The varying degrees of control and awareness relate to responses in communication. Responses become points in the decoding and encoding process for the development of perceptions with certain stimuli. The responses could be planned and could occur spontaneously (Holland et al. 2017).

Journals from literature numbers 1, 4, and 5 examine changes in people's knowledge, attitudes, and behavior in facing the COVID-19 pandemic. This pattern is formed in various aspects that form as well as inhibiting. The writings in the three publications can be supporting evidence on the urgency of the contribution of communication in mitigating the COVID-19 pandemic. Understanding the pandemic and the regulations that accompany it are part of mapping the Indonesian people's attitudes and behavior towards the COVID-19 issue. Communal people are accustomed to using signs to convey messages with a relatively high control and awareness level. Entities and objects of the communal system give the communicator and the communicant time to do the encoding and decoding appropriately by following the interaction's maxims.

In communal culture, awareness and control are important themes, especially in using non-verbal communication choices. This society had been developing specific knowledge, attitudes, and behaviors that follow default patterns. COVID-19 pandemic persuades this society to use particular non-verbal behavior in mitigating and delivering personal messages. Non-verbal behavior becomes more complicated compare to verbal behavior in communication (Eaves

and Leathers 2018). In this context, obstacles and disturbances in the communication process will tend to come in various forms. During the new habits adaptation of the COVID-19 pandemic, many non-verbal behaviors were accepted as new cultural characteristics.

Non-verbal behavior changes during the pandemic are taking place gradually, particularly in using space and time concepts. The presence of online media in conducting human relationship initiates the cultural values change. Therefore, non-verbal sign modification relates to adjusting the dysfunctional communication behavior. Change is interpreted as mitigation in capturing the urgency of the health emergency dimension and building flexibility in the communication style used by the communal community. The encoding and decoding behavior in non-verbal communication also occurs in particular awareness and control regarding the ability in responding beyond consciousness degree.

Several dichotomies influence classic nonverbal communication in viewing attachment and identity. Differences could occur in cultural characteristics such as individualism and collectivism, immediate versus non-immediate, low and high power distance, high versus low context, and feminine and masculine constructs (Burgoon et al. 2016). This socio-cultural condition also influences the choice of indexation of the signs of nonverbal behavior. During the COVID-19 mitigation, nonverbal behavior pattern changes were found mainly in haptics or touch cues. The spatial distance provisions use, individuals in cultural affiliations with individual or collective characteristics obeying the regulations always take a general distance (above 1 meter) even with familiar communicants or communicators.

Taking spatial distances can be part of eliminating differences in the dimension of "safe" distances. The spatial distance can function beyond other forms of nonverbal behavior, such as facial expressions or limb movements (Kostić and Chadee 2015). The initiation of changes in nonverbal communication patterns brings the construction of identity to a more open level. Communal communities that develop social behavior are closely related to the nonverbal language will immediately begin to get used to the media's help. Communication with the selection of nonverbal elements has functions for repeating, conflicting, complementing, substituting, accenting or moderating, and regulating (Knap et al. 2014). In executing these functions, an environment with the involvement of places, chronemics, and artifacts is needed (Burgoon et al. 2016). This new adaptation era can become a medium for dialogue on the use of symbols to reconstruct the meaning function in nonverbal communication. Communal societies such as Indonesia will take nonverbal signals with the urgency of mitigation to solidarity with the collectivity itself.

Conclusion

The COVID-19 pandemic has a multisectoral impact on the dimensions of the health emergency and the education, economic, social, and cultural sectors. Changes in pandemic mitigation have made all parties carry out regulation and

deregulation in various sectoral lines. Several journal literatures discussion show academic contributions in looking at various perspectives from the COVID-19 pandemic. Some regulations were issued with stay-at-home campaigns, social distancing, and physical distancing (Christin, Hidayat, and Rachmiatie 2021). The collectivity of Indonesian society, which has been represented by various signs and physical closeness formation identities, has experienced a shift.

Restrictions on physical activity are mainly related to interpersonal interactions with nonverbal behavior, resulting in a shift in the nonverbal communication function. Indonesian society places the concepts of space, time, and touch as attributes in forming a collective identity. The presence of the "adaptation of new habits" campaign makes descriptions of collective identities reproduced. In understanding with media communication, collectivity brings technology as a nonverbal channel that is tasked with conveying virtual interpersonal touches.

The implications of space and time limitation regulations in the context of nonverbal communication are likely to be more complicated. During COVID-19 adaptation, communication barriers not only occur partly in physiological, physical, semantical, and psychological but can take place simultaneously. This change does not place the terminology of an anything new acquisition. Instead, it makes adjustments using nonverbal behavior flexibility of conscious interactions on the urgency of health and human relationships.

Acknowledgment

This paper would have been impossible without the support of communication department colleagues, Universitas Trunojoyo Madura. Also we acknowledge for colleger in helping in documents collecting.

References

- Abidah, Azmil, Hasan Nurul Hidaayatullaah, Roy Martin Simamora, Daliana Fehabutar, Lely Mutakinati, and Et.al. (2020). "The Impact of Covid-19 to Indonesian Education and Its Relation to the Philosophy of 'Merdeka Belajar.'" *Studies in Philosophy of Science and Education* 1(1):38–49. doi: 10.46627/sipose.v1i1.9.
- Arribathi, Abdul Hamid, and Qurotul Aini. (2018). "Mudik Dalam Perspektif Budaya Dan Agama." *Journal Cyberpreneurship Innovative and Creative Exact and Social Science (CICES)* 4(1):45–52.
- Azhar, Muhamad. (2020). "Government Strategy in Implementing the Good Governance during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia." *Administrative Law and Governance Journal* 3(2):300–313. doi: 10.14710/alj.v3i2.300-313.
- Birdwhistell, Ray L. (1990). *Kinesics and Context Essays on Body Motion Communication*. Philadelphia: The University of Pennsylvania.
- Burgoon, Judee K., Laura K. Guerrero, and Kory Floyd. (2016). *Nonverbal Communication*. New York: Routledge.

Yuliana Rakhmawati:
Cultural Shifting And Non-Verbal Communication Reconstruction In Covid-19 Outbreak:
Indonesia'S Insight
Pergeseran Budaya Dan Rekonstruksi Komunikasi Non-Verbal Pada Pandemi Covid-19 Di
Indonesia

- Christin, Maylanny, Dasrun Hidayat, and Atie Rachmiatie. (2021). "Construction of Social Reality for Physical Distancing During the COVID-19 Pandemic." *Jurnal Komunikasi* 13(1):1. doi: 10.24912/jk.v13i1.9612.
- Conley, Willy. (2019). *Visual-Gestural Communication: A Workbook in Nonverbal Expression and Reception*. New York: Routledge.
- Crawford, Joseph, Kerrynt Butler-Henderson, Jurgen Rudolph, and Et Al. (2020). "COVID-19: 20 Countries' Higher Education Intra-Period Digital Pedagogy Responses." *Journal of Applied Learning & Teaching* 3(1):1–21. doi: 10.37074/jalt.2020.3.1.7.
- Dani, Jeratallah Aram, and Yogi Mediantara. (2020). "Covid-19 Dan Perubahan Komunikasi Sosial." *Persepsi: Communication Journal* 3(1):94–102. doi: 10.30596/persepsi.v3i1.4510.
- Darmawan, Dadang, Deni Miharja, Roro Sri Rejeki Waluyajati, and Erni Isnaeniah. (2020). "Sikap Keberagamaan Masyarakat Menghadapi Wabah COVID-19." *Religious: Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama Dan Lintas Budaya* 4(2):115–24. doi: 10.15575/rjsalb.v4i2.8596.
- Darsono, Dono, Jajang A. Rohmana, and Busro Busro. (2020). "Against COVID-19 Pandemic: Bibliometric Assessment of World Scholars' International Publications Related to COVID-19." *Jurnal Komunikasi Ikatan Sarjana Komunikasi Indonesia* 5(1):75–89. doi: 10.25008/jkiski.v5i1.356.
- Djalante, Riyanti, Jonatan Lassa, Davin Setiamarga, Aruminingsih Sudjatma, Mochamad Indrawan, Budi Haryanto, Choirul Mahfud, Muhammad Sabaruddin Sinapoy, Susanti Djalante, Irina Rafliana, Lalu Adi Gunawan, Gusti Ayu Ketut Surtiari, and Henny Warsilah. (2020). "Review and Analysis of Current Responses to COVID-19 in Indonesia: Period of January to March 2020." *Progress in Disaster Science* 6(march):100091. doi: 10.1016/j.pdisas.2020.100091.
- Eaves, Michael H., and Dale Leathers. (2018). *Successful Nonverbal Communication: Principles and Applications*. New York: Ruotledge.
- Fink, Arlene. (2014). *Conducting Research Literature Reviews: From the Internet to Paper*. 4th ed. London: Sage.
- Firman, Firman, and Sari Rahayu. (2020). "Pembelajaran Online Di Tengah Pandemi Covid-19." *Indonesian Journal of Educational Science (IJES)* 2(2):81–89. doi: 10.31605/ijes.v2i2.659.
- Goldin-Meadow, Susan, and Martha Wagner Alibali. (2013). "Gesture's Role in Speaking, Learning, and Creating Language." *Annual Review of Psychology* 64(1):257–83. doi: 10.1146/annurev-psych-113011-143802.
- Gunawan, Ni Made Yeni Suranti, and Fathoroni. (2020). "Variations of Models and Learning Platforms for Perspective Teachers During the COVID-19 Pandemic Period." *Indonesian Journal of Teacher Education* 1(2):61–70.
- Hall, Edward T. (1959). *The Silence Language*. New York: DoubleDay Company.
- Hall, Edward T. (1968). "Proxemics." *Current Athropology* 9(2–3):83–105.
- Hamid, Agus Rizal Ardy Hariandy. (2020). "Social Responsibility of Medical Journal: A Concern for COVID-19 Pandemic." *Medical Journal of Indonesia* 29(1):1–3. doi: 10.13181/mji.ed.204629.

- Hanoatubun, Silpa. (2020). “Dampak COVID 1 Terhadap Perekonomian Indonesia.” *EduPsyCouns Journal* 2(1):146–53.
- Hidayat, Dasrun. (2014). “Social and Cultural Identity Pendekatan Face Negotiation Theory Dan Public Relations Multikulturalism Negara Jerman-China Dan Indonesia.” *Jurnal ASPIKOM* 2(2):115. doi: 10.24329/aspikom.v2i2.64.
- Holland, Elise, Elizabeth Baily Wolf, Christine Looser, and Amy Cuddy. (2017). “Visual Attention to Powerful Postures: People Avert Their Gaze from Nonverbal Dominance Displays.” *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 68:60–67. doi: 10.1016/j.jesp.2016.05.001.
- Irianto, Agus Maladi. (2012). “Mudik Dan Keretakan Budaya.” *Humanika* 15(9):10. doi: 10.14710/humanika.15.9.
- Jolly, Stephen. (2000). “Understanding Body Language: Birdwhistell’s Theory of Kinesics.” *Corporate Communications: An International Journal* 5(3):133–39. doi: 10.1108/13563280010377518.
- Katsumi, Yuta, Suhkyung Kim, Keen Sung, Florin Dolcos, and Sanda Dolcos. (2017). “When Nonverbal Greetings ‘Make It or Break It’: The Role of Ethnicity and Gender in the Effect of Handshake on Social Appraisals.” *Journal of Nonverbal Behavior* 41(4):345–65. doi: 10.1007/s10919-017-0257-0.
- Keogh, Edmund. (2014). “Gender Differences in the Nonverbal Communication of Pain: A New Direction for Sex, Gender, and Pain Research?” *Pain* 155(10):1927–31. doi: 10.1016/j.pain.2014.06.024.
- Khairani, Eva. 2020. “Psikologi Komunikasi Humas Aceh Dalam Menyikapi Pandemi Korona (Covid-19).” *Jurnal Peurawi* 3(1):103–19.
- Khasanah, Dian Ratu Ayu Uswatun, Hascaryo Pramudibyanto, and Barokah Widuroyekti. 2020. “Pendidikan Dalam Masa Pandemi Covid-19.” *Jurnal Sinestesia* 10(1):41–48.
- Knap, Mark L., Judith A. Hall, and Terrence G. Horgan. 2014. *Nonverbal Communication in Human Interaction*. 8th ed. Boston: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning.
- Komalasari, Rita. 2020. “Manfaat Teknologi Informasi Dan Komunikasi Di Masa Pandemi COVID 19.” *TEMATIK: Jurnal Teknologi Informasi Dan Komunikasi* 7(1):38–50.
- Kostić, Aleksandra, and Derek Chadee. (2015). *The Social Psychology of Nonverbal Communication*. edited by A. Kostić and D. Chadee. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Kurniawan, Andri, Nibrasatul Yumna, and Erna Tantri. 2020. “Resistensi Ruang Publik Di Tengah COVID 19 Perspektif Islam Dan Komunikasi Multikulutural.” *Komunike* 12(1):24–40.
- Littlejohn, Stephen W., and Karen A. Foss. 2008. *Theories of Human Communication*. Belmont: Thomson Wadsworth.
- Littlejohn, Stephen W., and Karen A. Foss. 2009. *Encyclopedia of Communication Theory*. California: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Lorié, Áine, Diego A. Reiner, Margot Phillips, Linda Zhang, and Helen Riess. (2017). “Culture and Nonverbal Expressions of Empathy in Clinical

- Settings: A Systematic Review.” *Patient Education and Counseling* 100(3):411–24. doi: 10.1016/j.pec.2016.09.018.
- Martha, Jessica. (2020). “Pemanfaatan Diplomasi Publik Oleh Indonesia Dalam Krisis Covid-19.” *Jurnal Ilmiah Hubungan Internasional* 0(0):121–30.
- Martin, Judith N., and Thomas K. Nakayama. 2010. “Intercultural Communication in Legal Contexts.” Pp. 1–560 in *Intercultural communication in legal contexts*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- McKibbin, Warwick, and Roshen Fernando. 2020. “The Global Macroeconomic Impacts of COVID-19: Seven Scenarios.” *Asian Economic Papers* 1–55. doi: 10.1162/asep_a_00796.
- Muhyiddin, A., R. Rosyad, M. T. Rahman, and Yeni Huriani. (2020). “Urgensi Penjelasan Keagamaan Terhadap Keluarga Suspek Pasien Dalam Pengawasan (PDP) Covid-19.” *Hanifiya: Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama* 3(1):35–42. doi: 10.15575/hanifiya.v3i1.8365.
- Nasir, Narila Mutia, Baequni Baequni, and Mochamad Iqbal Nurmansyah. 2020. “Misinformation Related COVID-19 In Indonesia.” *Jurnal Administrasi Kesehatan Indonesia* 8(2):51. doi: 10.20473/jaki.v8i2.2020.51-59.
- Park, Kyung Hye, and Seung Guk Park. 2018. “The Effect of Communication Training Using Standardized Patients on Nonverbal Behaviors in Medical Students.” *Korean Journal of Medical Education* 30(2):153–59. doi: 10.3946/kjme.2018.90.
- Pragholapati, Andria. (2020). “Covid-19 Impact on Students.” 1–6.
- Puertas-Molero, Pilar, Félix Zurita-Ortega, Ramón Chacón-Cuberos, Asunción Martínez-Martínez, Manuel Castro-Sánchez, and Gabriel González-Valero. 2018. “An Explanatory Model of Emotional Intelligence and Its Association with Stress, Burnout Syndrome, and Non-Verbal Communication in the University Teachers.” *Journal of Clinical Medicine* 7(12):524. doi: 10.3390/jcm7120524.
- Purwanto, Agus, Rudy Pramono, Masduki Asbari, Priyono Budi Santoso, Laksmi Mayesti Wijayanti, Chi Hyun Choi, and Ratna Setyowati Putri. 2020. “Studi Eksploratif Dampak Pandemi COVID-19 Terhadap Proses Pembelajaran Online Di Sekolah Dasar.” *EduPsyCouns: Journal of Education, Psychology and Counseling* 2(1):1–12.
- Roslidah, Navila, and Indra Komara. 2017. “Culture Differences of Indonesia Ethnic Minorities in Non-Verbal Communication.” *Jurnal Studi Komunikasi (Indonesian Journal of Communications Studies)* 1(1):6–18. doi: 10.25139/jsk.v1i1.60.
- Saltikov, Josette Bettany. 2012. *How to Do a Systematic Literature Review in Nursing. A Step-by-Step Guide*. London: Open University Press.
- Samovar, Larry A., Richard E. Porter, and Edwin R. McDaniel. 2010. *Communication Between Cultures: A Reader*. Boston: Wadsworth.
- Sampurno, Muchammad Bayu Tejo, Tri Cahyo Kusumandyoko, and Muh Ariffudin Islam. 2020. “Budaya Media Sosial, Edukasi Masyarakat, Dan Pandemi COVID-19.” *SALAM: Jurnal Sosial Dan Budaya Syar-I* 7(5):529–42. doi: 10.15408/sjsbs.v7i5.15210.

- Saunderson, Shane, and Goldie Nejat. 2019. *How Robots Influence Humans: A Survey of Nonverbal Communication in Social Human–Robot Interaction*. Vol. 11. Springer Netherlands.
- Setiati, Siti, and Muhammad Khifzhon Azwar. 2020. “COVID-19 and Indonesia.” *Acta Medica Indonesia* 52(April):84–89.
- Supriadi, Ida Bagus Putu. 2017. “Kolektivitas Tindakan Beragama Krama Adat Binaan Majelis Madya Desa Pakraman Kota Denpasar.” *Vidya Samhita* 3(2):63–76.
- Suryaatmadja, Shannon, and Nova Maulani. 2020. “Contributions of Space Technology To Global Health In The Context of COVID-19.” *Jurnal Administrasi Kesehatan Indonesia* 8(1 Special Issues):60–73. doi: 10.20473/jaki.v8i2.2020.60-73.
- Syafrida, Syafrida. 2020. “Bersama Melawan Virus Covid 19 Di Indonesia.” *SALAM: Jurnal Sosial Dan Budaya Syar-I* 7(6):495–508. doi: 10.15408/sjsbs.v7i6.15325.
- Tonggo, Hasian Laurentius, and Irwansyah Irwansyah. 2021. “Mediated Catholic Mass During the COVID-19 Pandemic: On Communication, Technology and Spiritual Experience.” *Jurnal Komunikasi* 13(1):20. doi: 10.24912/jk.v13i1.9714.
- Umar, Nugrah Juniar. 2020. “(#)Stayhome Hashtag As A Social Campaign To Prevent The Covid 19 through Instagram in Makassar City.” *Palakka:Media and Islamic Communication* 1(1):23–35.
- Vijver, Fons J. R. 2017. “Nonverbal Communication across Cultures.” *The International Encyclopedia of Intercultural Communication* 1–10. doi: 10.1002/9781118783665.ieicc0252.
- Vogel, Daniela, Marco Meyer, and Sigrid Harendza. 2018. “Verbal and Non-Verbal Communication Skills Including Empathy during History Taking of Undergraduate Medical Students.” *BMC Medical Education* 18(1):1–7. doi: 10.1186/s12909-018-1260-9.
- Vrij, Aldert, Maria Hartwig, and Pär Anders Granhag. (2019). “Annual Review of Psychology Reading Lies: Nonverbal Communication and Deception.” *Annu. Rev. Psychol* 70:295–317.
- Wahono, Romi Satria. 2016. “Systematic Literature Review : Pengantar, Tahapan Dan Studi Kasus.” Retrieved August 18, 2020 (<https://romisatriawahono.net/2016/05/15/systematic-literature-review-pengantar-tahapan-dan-studi-kasus/>).
- Xu, Yu, Shelley Staples, and Jay J. Shen. (2012). “Nonverbal Communication Behaviors of Internationally Educated Nurses and Patient Care.” *Research and Theory for Nursing Practice* 26(4):290–308. doi: 10.1891/1541-6577.26.4.290.
- Yunus, Nur Rohim, and Annissa Rezki. (2020). “Kebijakan Pemberlakuan Lock Down Sebagai Antisipasi Penyebaran Corona Virus Covid-19.” *SALAM: Jurnal Sosial Dan Budaya Syar-I* 7(3). doi: 10.15408/sjsbs.v7i3.15083.