ELECTRONIC CERTIFICATE IN THE DIGITALIZATION OF LAND MANAGEMENT IN INDONESIA: AN APPLICATION OF THEORY “FOR WHAT IS INEXISTENT – A NEW ONE IS PROCURED”

Benny Djaja* & Laura Helena Wiryana*

1Faculty of Law, Tarumanagara University, Jakarta  
   Email: bennyd@fh.untar.ac.id  
2Faculty of Law, Tarumanagara University, Jakarta  
   Email: laurahelenewirayana@gmail.com

*Corresponding author.

Submitted: July 2022, Revised: December 2022, Accepted: February 2023

ABSTRACT
This research aims to analyze the introduction of Electronic Land Certificate by using the theory proposed by Soerjono Soekanto: “For what is inexistente – a new one is procured” This research employs juridical-normative methods which is tend to be descriptive and using primary, secondary, tertiary data related to the phenomena issuance of regulations and introduction of new legal product from the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency. Electronic Certificate in land sector brings a fresh air and is expected to become a solution to prevent future land dispute in Indonesia. Electronic certificate and digital transformation in managing the land sector would assist the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency to detect land mafia syndicate movement which is difficult to overcome because of internal and external factors. The introduction of electronic certificate has been in accordance with the factors of facilities providence supported by the concept “For what is inexistente – a new one is procured”.

Keywords: Soerjono Soekanto, electronic land certificate, land digitizing

1. PREFACE
Land is one of the natural resources which greatly affects life. Inherent in each land parcels are economic, social, and productive functions which support and promote human well-being through land use and ownership [1]. Considering the importance of the function of the soil, the State have the obligation to manage it for prosperity of the people as regulated in the preamble of the 1945 Constitution, wherein one of the goals of the State is to create the human well-being. State efforts in providing to ensure human well-being and affluence are enshrined in Article 4 paragraph 1 of Law Number 5 of 1960 on the Basic Rules of Agrarian Principles as well as in Article 4 paragraph 1 of Government Regulations Number 24 of 1997 on Land Registration that has undergone the third change through Regulation of the State Ministry of Agrarian Affairs/Head of National Land Agency Number 3 of 1997 concerning Provisions on the Implementation of Government.

Regulation Number 24 of 1997 concerning Land Registration. Article 4 paragraph 1 of Law Number 5 of 1960 on the Basic Rules of Agrarian Principles stipulates that each individuals, legal entities, institutions, or common property must first register the land parcel in order to obtain the right over land in the form of Right for Building Use, Right for Business Uses, and Right of Ownership. This is meant to avoid overlapping ownership of land rights documents as well as to prevent acknowledgment and claim by another parties on land ownership. Land registration is a series of activities performed by the government continuously by collecting specific descriptions and data concerning certain land parcel in a particular region [2]. Article 4 paragraph 1 of Government Regulations Number 24 of 1997 declares that “[I]o provide legal...
certainty and protection as intended in Article 3 letter a, to the relevant land rights holder is given a certificate of land rights”.

Land registration results in the form of documents called “certificate”. According to the legal dictionary, certificate is defined as a letter serving as proof of rights over land, management rights, wakaf land, rights of ownership to strata title, and mortgage rights, each has been recorded according to the shape of the land concerned [3]. The purpose of certification is for the benefits of the right holders based on the physical and juridical data registered in the land book. As stated above, the certificate serves as an authentic proof of land ownership, so that when another parties claim its ownership, the original right holder would already have legally valid evidence to counter such claim[4]. However, in its further development, certificates are quite easy to be forged or duplicated considering their simple form. Falsification can occur in any land sale and purchase transaction conducted by land mafia and assisted by National Land Agency insider. According to observations made by the National Land Agency, land mafia would act as applicants for vacant land rights or pretending to be a prospective buyer, requesting or borrowing a certificate under the pretext of conducting pre-transaction mandatory checking, but instead they make counterfeit certificate which they “return” to the original owner. Land mafia can also act as an impostor “Land Official”.

Land mafia can even go as far as legalizing land ownership through the judiciary body with feigned civil lawsuit, submitting proof of ownership in the form of counterfeit deed of eigendom, provided that a lawsuit can be made with the owner not being present in the courtroom. Based on the data aggregated by the National Land Agency, there are land activities related to counterfeiting by 60%, embezzlement or fraud by 16%, and occupancy of liars by 11% [5].

In today’s era of development, land problems have become very board in scope and has gained widespread attention. This occurs because development activities are highly linked with land as one of the primary human needs, so that all kinds of development activities will be more or less related to the land sectors [6]. Land issues contain various aspects, ranging from state administrative law, management of state affairs, as well as criminal and civil law. Land disputes can be handled through both civil and criminal legal approach. When none of all the above possibilities is applicable, then those issues will become a socio-political problem, even resulting to security issues.

The authority possessed by the National Land Agency is very limited on encountering problems. Therefore, the National Land Agency cooperates with the police forces, Attorney General’s Office, and the Judicial Commission to consult each other and resolve land issues. The Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency also continues to try and prevent frauds including counterfeiting by improving the systems, namely by accelerating the digitization of land register. Digitization will make any actions by the land mafia more difficult to take place, including any attempt to falsify certificate.

The above attempts for improvements are in line with the theory conceptualized by Soerjono Soekanto, who proposed the following: (a) For what is inexistent – a new one is procured; (b) What is damaged or wrong – repaired or corrected; (c) What is inadequate – provided; (d) What is obstructed – expedited; and (e) What is regressing or declining – developed or improved.

This research uses at least two of the above propositions, namely “For what is inexistent – a new is one procured” is deemed suitable within the context of digital transformation in the land
sectors, both in providing services as well as in the digital transformation of the land rights ownership documents i.e., certificate. Electronic certification is a policy innovation issued by the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land and Agency as an effort to protect and provide legal certainty for holders of land rights documents. It serves as an effort and solution to help the Ministry in overcoming land problems that have all this time been difficult to resolve.

The introduction of electronic certificates have a purpose, that is to serve as an embodiment of the modernization of land affairs services. For one, it improves public services indicator at the land office in accordance with the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning or National Land Agency Regulation Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificate, rendering it increasingly important and needed.

In a nutshell, the purpose of this study was to find the alignment of Soerjono Soekanto’s theory with the contemporary changes in land rights ownership documents towards digitization, as well as the functions and benefits of shifting to electronic land certificates. Particularly, this study poses the question as to why electronic land certificate is needed and whether it is in line with Soerjono Soekanto’s legal theory. Using a juridical-normative approach method, this paper will examine the above questions more deeply by using a literature study approach where the existing body of laws and regulations, Ministrial regulations, journals of academic research, and the result of Webinars will be used for analysis.

2. RESEARCH METHOD
This study used a juridical-normative, descriptive method, analyzing the relevancy of Soerjono Soekanto’s theory of thoughts in exploring more deeply about the new legal products issued by the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency. The researcher used a statutory approach, namely by studying the regulation related to the occurring phenomenon and using data analysis techniques in the form of qualitative data available in words instead of numbers.

The data collection technique used by the researcher is literature study in the form of searching and collecting data information through books, related journals, and previous research reports as well as Webinars. The type of data being used is secondary data consisting of primary, secondary, and tertiary legal materials. Primary legal materials are legal materials with binding forces which include Law number 5 of 1960 concerning Basic Regulations on Agrarian Principles, Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency Regulation Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificate, as well as other regulations relevant to this research.

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION
Electronic Land Certificate
In early 2021, a policy was issued by the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/ National Land Agency authorizing the issuance of documents as proof of land rights ownership in electronic forms or an electronic certificate (e-certificate). The policy was issued to further carry out the provisions in the Job Creation Law Number 11 of 2020 in Land Affairs Cluster mandating that land services are to be transferred into electronic forms, including electronic document as proof of land rights ownership.
On January 12th, 2021, the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency Sofyan A. Djali signed the beleid on electronic certificate in the form of Ministryal Regulation Number 1 of 2021. The purpose of this policy is to modernize land services to improve indicators of Ease of Doing Business (EoDB) and electronic-based public services [7].

There are 6 (six) differences between electronic and physical certificates, as follows [8]:

(a) E-certificate uses a hash code or unique electronic document code generated by the system, while physical certificate has a unique serial number of letters and numbers combination; (b) E-certificate uses QR Code which contains a link, making it easy for the public to directly access electronic documents, while physical certificate does not have any QR Code; (c) E-certificate uses only one number, namely the Field Identification Number (Nomor Identifikasi Bidang / NIB) as the single identity, while the physical certificate uses many identification numbers, namely right of land ownership number, land measurement letter number, field identification number, and field map number; (d) The provisions concerning obligations and prohibitions in e-certificate are mentioned with a statement of aspects of rights, prohibitions, and also responsibilities, while on a physical certificate the recording of these provisions is listed in the instructions column and not in a uniform manner depending on the regional land offices; (e) E-certificate uses electronic signatures and cannot be forged, while physical certificate use manual signatures and is prone to forgery; (f) E-certificate is issued in the form of electronic document containing information on specified land parcel in an informative and concise manner, while physical certificate is issued in the form of several blank pages.

In the past, land registration was carried out conventionally, but now it can be done electronically, either for first time land registrations or with regards to data maintenance. The electronic land registration service has actually been in design process since the enactment of Government Regulation Number 24 of 1997. In article 35 paragraphs (5), (6), and (7) stipulates that: “Land registration data shall be progressively stored and displayed using electronic films and micro equipment. Documentary records generated electronically or microfilms are endowed with evidentiary power following its signature and affiliation of official stamp by the relevant Head of Land Offices” (“Data pendaftaran tanah secara bertahap disimpan dan disajikan menggunakan film elektronik dan peralatan mikro. Rekaman dokumen yang dihasilkan dengan sarana elektronik atau mikrofilm mempunyai kekuatan pembuktian setelah ditandatangani dan dibubuh cap resmi oleh Kepala Kantor Pertanahan yang bersangkutan”). Electronic land registration will be carried out in stages, starting with application of government-owned land parcels. Electronic certificates will have positive impact on the improving performance of the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning / National Land Agency, especially on the protection bestowed on public’s documents of land rights ownership against the activities of land mafia syndicates that are both materially and immaterially harmful. The resulting product of electronic land registration will of course be electronic in format and is called electronic document.

This ranges from any electronic information created, forwarded, sent, received, or stored in analog, digital, electromagnetic, optical, or similar forms, which can be viewed, displayed, and/or heard through a computer or electronic system, including but not limited to writings, sounds, pictures, design maps, photographs or the like, letters, signs, numbers, access codes, symbols, or perforations with artistic meanings or can be understood by the people who are able to understand the substance of Article 1 paragraph 1 of the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency Regulation Number 1 of 2021.
Electronic Certificate in Indonesian Land Registration

Land registration are the series of activities that carried out by the government continuously and regularly, by means in collecting certain data regarding to the land parcels in certain areas, processing, accounting and presenting and maintaining physical and juridical data in form of maps and lists and regarding plots of land and flats also including the granting of certificates as a proof for rights over land ownership, for apartment units, as well as certain rights that encumber them[2]. Land registration in Indonesia aims to provide legal certainty (rechts cadastral) and protection of land ownership. In contrast to the purpose of land registration before the Basic Agrarian Law during the Old Agrarian Law (Colonial Agrarian Law), land registration was only applied to land parcels that were subject to the Western Agrarian Law, or lands with Western rights. There was almost zero impact on the customary land rights owned by the indigenous people. The institution for land registration first appeared for land parcels that have never been registered according to Government Regulation Number 10 of 1961 or Government Regulation Number 24 of 1997[9]. Meanwhile, maintenance of land registration data was carried out with the aim that the data stored in the Land Office is in accordance with field data (accurate).

The result of land registration process is the issuance of documents as the proof of rights that function as strong juridical evidence (Article 19 paragraph (2) letter c). The document intended for proving land ownership rights is called certificate, which contains a copy of the Land Book and Measurement Letter sewn together with a cover paper in the form as determined by the Ministry (Article 13 paragraph (3) Government Regulation Number 10 of 1961). Government Regulation Number 24 of 1997 then established that certificates as proofs of land rights, management rights, and wakaf lands rights can also be issued in the form of a single sheet document containing the required physical and juridical data. In early 2021, a policy was issued by the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning / National Land Agency to release the documents for proving land ownership rights in electronic form or electronic certificates (e-certificates), in order to further implement the provisions in the Job Creation Law Number 11 of 2020 for Land Affairs Cluster which mandated land services to be transferred into electronic form, including the documents issued as proof of rights. According to Article 5 of Law Number 11 of 2008 concerning Information and Electronic Transactions, electronic information and/or documents and/or their printed version are valid legal evidence, which is an extension of the valid legal evidence in accordance with the applicable procedural law in Indonesia. According to Article 5 of the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency Regulation Number 1 of 2021 which regulates Electronic Certificates, electronic documents and their printed results are considered as a valid legal evidence and an extension of valid legal evidence in accordance with the procedural law in Indonesia. For purpose of proof, electronic documents are accessible through the electronic system. According to Sudikno Mertokusumo, a document or writing is anything that’s contains of reading signs intended to pour out one’s heart or to convey one's thoughts and used as evidence [10].

Article 101 of Law Number 5 of 1986 determines that documents as means of evidence consist of 3 (three) types, namely [10]: (a) Authentic Deed, that is a document made by or in the presence of a public official who according to the laws and regulations is authorized to make the intended document to be used as evidence regarding the legal events or events contained therein; (b) Underhand Deed, that is a document made and signed by the parties concerned with the intention of being used as evidence regarding the legal events or events contained therein; (c) Other documents that are not deed.
Based on above provisions, it can be concluded that e-certificate has same legal force as its physical counterpart, both documents serve as a proof of rights and a means of proof in the court in the context of law enforcement.

**Soerjono Soekanto’s Theory of Legal Effectiveness and His Thoughts**
Legal effectiveness has a legal meaning highlighted in terms of the goals aimed to be achieved, one of which is the conventional efforts to encourage people to obey the rule of law by including sanctions. The sanctions can be in both negative and positive forms, intended to have deterrent effects so that humans do not commit disgraceful actions and take commendable actions instead [11]. In the theory of legal effectiveness according to Soerjono Soekanto, it is proposed that whether or not a law is effective shall be determined by 4 (four) factors [11], namely: a) The law itself (the laws and regulations); b) Law enforcement; c) The facilities; and e) The community.

Provisions in the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency Regulation Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificate were crafted in consideration of the above factors. Electronic certificates must be made as good as possible to make it applicable by the law enforcers, namely those who first apply the law before it is applied to the public. Electronic certificates are part of the many legal products which serves as a facility and utility to benefit the community. The introduction of electronic certificates and its underlying regulations must be accompanied by public outreach by means of socialization. The community as implementers of legal products must comply with the existing regulations and shall make use of the provided utilities and facilities in the best ways possible. The focus is not only on regulations, but also on the existing utilities and facilities, which shall best be in line with the following concepts [11]: (a) For what is inexist – a new one is procured; (b) What is damaged or wrong – repaired or corrected; (c) What is inadequate – provided; (d) What is obstructed – expedited; and (e) What is regressing or declining – developed or improved.

Without the underlying utilities and facilities, regulations and law enforcement will not align and conform with the above theory, when associated with the application of electronic certificates and its underlying regulations, we could identify, namely “For what is inexist – a new one is procured”. When elaborated and associated with the existence of electronic certificates which will soon be applied, it is a relatively new improvement in the land sector. In the midst of rampant digitalization in all fields, the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency also contributes on providing protection through digital transformation intended as an embodiment of convenience in land activities and legal certainty for the community.

**The Relation of Electronics Land Certificate to Soerjono Soekanto’s Theory “For what is inexist – a new one is procured”**
Modern land registration methods need to be implemented to increase productivity and efficiency in the Indonesian land registration system [12]. The land registration system should be enhanced to provide a modern framework in meeting the rapid growth of development [13], one of the Indonesian government efforts especially the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency is to create a new policy and a new law product such as electronic land certificate as the final result of modern land registration.

Electronic certificates become one of the current development, digital transformation of land is intended to be a time and cost savings in land registration which will increase public awareness to immediately register their land so as to reduce national and comprehensive land disputes.
Electronic certificates are based on the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency Regulation Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates, electronic certificates are the latest innovation that can even be the latest solution to resolve land disputes, it is appropriate for the Ministry of Affairs and Spatial Planning/ National Land Agency to issue this policy.

In its development, the State Ministry of Agrarian Affairs/National Land Agency Regulation Article 163A stipulates that “Land Books are to be stored electronically in the form of database in an electronic system and are printable using the List of Land Books Contents” ("Buku Tanah disimpan secara elektronik dengan bentuk basis data dalam Sistem Elektronik dan dapat dicetak dengan menggunakan Daftar Isian Buku Tanah"), whilst Article 178A stipulates that certificates can be printed in the form of electronic documents through an electronic system. Such certificate is then ratified with an electronic signature in accordance with the regulatory provisions.

The security system in electronic land certificate can be identify whether or not have been changes to the documents of ownership of land rights [14]. This kind of protection leads and refers to the idea of fulfilling the interests of the community and the interests of the law, where the existence of new legal products reflects the idea of always keeping the law abreast of the times and cultural changes in the community. Talking about the interest of law, the interest of law is to take care of human rights and interests that need to be regulated and protected [15]. Where the law "reflects" on the interests and needs of the community as well as the evolving culture, adjusted to accommodate development of the era. In accordance to the statement, the electronic land certificate becomes a true reflection of the law. Electronics land certificates along with Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/ National Land Agency Regulation Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates have been reflected on the needs, developments in society and following the increasingly rapid flow of digitalization and also electronic land certificate become the newest facilities for the community.

The presence of electronic certificates is in line with Soerjono Soekanto's theory, “For what is inexistent – a new one is procured”. If discussed in depth, it can be explained that before the advent of digital transformation that occurred in almost all fields, land registration in Indonesia was a long series of activities and had transparency and lack of supervision in its manufacture. This can be proven by the overlapping ownership of land ownership rights, land mafia syndicates and several cases of unscrupulous persons in the National Land Agency who assist the land mafia in carrying out their actions, as well as the existence of falsification of figures and the results of land registration, namely certificates.

Land certificates in fact still have shortcomings or lack of strict supervision and the absence of adequate prevention and protection against land disputes such as falsification of certificates, overlapping documents that cause immaterial or material losses, this of course triggers public distrust of the government, especially the Ministry of Affairs and Spatial Planning/ National Land Agency in providing guarantees for the protection of their assets, from the existence of these problems, the Ministry of Affairs and Spatial Planning/ National Land Agency seeks to restore public trust by presenting a new innovation, this innovation is encouraged to provide protection, services that keep up with the times, namely by presenting electronic certificates. Electronic certificates are an innovation and a new form of effort from the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs/National Land Agency for the public interest. So, if it is related to the theory presented by Soerjono Soekanto “For what is inexistent – a new one is procured”. It can be said that electronic certificates are in line with this theory, something that did not exist before is now
actually created a new one, and has the aim of providing protection, transparency, and prevention of land disputes that often occur.

4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
Electronic Certificates have effectiveness both in general and from a legal point of view, this is in accordance with Soerjono Soekanto's thought, namely “For what is inexisten – a new one is procured”. Electronic certificates are something that has never existed and been applied, especially in land sector. If it is linked to the theory of legal effectiveness, which is also explained by Soerjono Soekanto regarding the facilities and infrastructure. Electronic Certificates are facilities that follow the development in the era and that's reflected to the true law. The need for electronic certificates is as a medium to shorten the time, costs for people who will register their land, by offering this facility people will be encouraged to register their land. So, in land registration activities there are no more land mafia syndicates collaborating with elements in the BPN, overlapping documents on ownership of land rights, and land mafia syndicates targeting vacant land.

Electronic certificates have a strong ground for its existence, a basis as to why it is necessary. It serves as a medium to shorten the time and cost to complete land registration. With this convenience afforded, more people will register their land and consequently, opportunities for another land mafia syndicate targeting vacant land shall be significantly reduced. Electronic certificates are also based on the thoughts and efforts of the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency in eradicating and reducing land disputes which have so far along been a difficult issue to resolve.

Prior to the national implementation of electronic certificate to the general public, it is better for the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency to resolve land disputes, such as land registration for vacant land parcels by using a systematic registration mechanism based on the the Ministry's working plan, resolving disputes within the National Land Agency itself by implementing strict penalty to internal members of the National Land Agency who are found to have helped the land mafia in their crimes. In addition, socialization can also be done through various public media, such as electronic (television or websites) and printed media (newspapers or magazines), as well as specifically targeted to public notaries and land officials through seminars, web seminars, or interactive workshops.

Acknowledgement
The author would like to thank profusely to all parties who have helped and supported in the process of writing this article.

REFERENCES
Benny Djaja, Quo Vadis Undang-Undang Pokok Agraria? Suatu Tinjauan Terhadap Permasalahan Pertanahan di Usia Undang-Undang Pokok Agraria yang ke Lima Puluhan
Delapan Tahun, Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Hukum Volume 16, Nomor 1 Juni 2018. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24912/erahukum.v16i1.2372.


R. B. Agus Wijayanto, Webinar Strategi Pemberantasan Mafia Tanah Demi Mewujudkan Kepastian Hukum dan Keadilan Sosial, 09-11-2021


Soerjono Soekanto, Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Penegakan Hukum, Raja Grafindo Persada, 2008.
